Citizenship in Athens and Rome: Which Was the Better System?

MINI-Q™ LESSON PLAN

**DAY 1 — 45 minutes**

**Step One: Hook** Refer to the Step One teacher notes in the Mini-Q. Read the directions aloud. The purpose is to get students engaged, talking, and wanting to do the Mini-Q.

**Step Two: Background Essay** Refer to the Step Two teacher notes in the Mini-Q. Students can write out answers to the BGE questions or the questions can simply be discussed.

**Step Three: Understanding the Question and Pre-Bucketing** The task of recognizing and defining key words in the question is a crucial habit of mind. The second task of pre-bucketing based on clues in the question and in document titles is a huge categorization skill.

**Step Four: Document Analysis** Do Document A with the whole class, modeling the kind of detail you expect in student answers to the Document Analysis questions.

Homework: Analyze the remaining documents and answer the questions that follow.

**DAY 2 — 45 minutes**

**Step Four (continued): Discussion of Documents**

Option One: Working in pairs or threesomes, have students discuss the answers to the first set of Document Analysis questions they did for homework. Using a different-colored pen than they used for homework, they may add to their answers. After five minutes, open the discussion of that document to the full class. Then proceed to the next document and repeat.

Option Two: Proceed as above, but have a volunteer group lead each of the three or four different document discussions. Students at their desks may add to their notes, again in a different pen.

**Step Five: Bucketing and Chicken Foot** Have students complete the bucketing and chicken foot work page. This step will help students clarify their thesis and road map.

**Step Six: From Thesis to Essay Writing** For Homework: Have students fill out the Outline Guide Sheet or write their multi-paragraph essay.

**DAY 3 (Optional)**

**Step Six (continued): Conduct an in-class Writing Workshop.**

MINI-Q™ LESSON PLAN: CLEAN VERSION OPTION

If students are ready, use the Clean Version of the Mini-Q, which requires them to handle more of the analysis on their own. Estimated time to complete is 1-2 class periods.
Overview: The right to be a citizen of a country is not a modern idea. In fact, the laws for being a citizen in the United States today trace back thousands of years to ancient Athens and Rome. This Mini-Q looks at how citizenship worked in these two great early societies and asks you to decide which system was best.

The Documents:

- Document B: Expanding Citizenship in Athens and Rome
- Document C: Controlling Citizenship in Athens and Rome
- Document D: Participation in the Government of Athens
- Document E: Participation in the Government of Rome
Hook Exercise: Citizenship in Athens and Rome

Part I
Directions: As of 2010, everyone born in the United States, or born to U.S. citizens overseas, automatically becomes a U.S. citizen. However, for an adult immigrant to become a U.S. citizen, he or she must go through a process called naturalization, which includes the eight requirements listed below. With a partner, discuss each requirement. Then check whether or not you support it. If you and your partner disagree, make two check marks.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Support</th>
<th>Do Not Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Must be at least 18 years of age</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Must have been legally admitted to the U.S. (holder of a green card)</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Must have lived in the United States for at least five years (if single)</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Must have lived in the United States for at least three years (if married to a U.S. citizen)</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Must have no prison record</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Must be able to speak, read, and write English</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Must pass a test on U.S. history and the Constitution</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Must swear allegiance (loyalty) to the United States</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part II
There have been proposals to add other citizenship requirements. Which of the following would you support?

1. Must perform one year of national service either in the military or a public agency like a school or the national park service.

2. Must have graduated from high school or received a GED certificate.

3. Must be in school, have proof of employment, or proof of a net worth of $100,000.
Citizenship in Athens and Rome: Which Was the Better System?

About 500 BCE, on the Greek and Italian peninsulas of the Mediterranean Sea, a new idea began to develop. This was the notion that people were citizens of a state or empire, and that being a citizen meant not only meeting certain responsibilities but also enjoying certain rights. Before this time, in places like Egypt, Babylonia, and ancient China, individuals were generally regarded as subjects, not as citizens. Power was largely in the hands of a pharaoh, king, or emperor and the thousands of administrators who carried out the ruler’s command. But by the sixth century BCE, a new idea was emerging: that ordinary people should play a more significant role in the life of the state.

Citizenship is a status, or standing, given by a government to some or all of its people. In the modern world, citizenship often involves a balance between individual rights, such as the right to vote, and individual responsibilities, such as the duty to serve one’s country. This balance has been called the social contract theory of citizenship. The individual does his or her part; the nation or state does its part.

It is probably accurate to say that in the city-state of Athens, the emphasis was more on citizen responsibility than citizen rights. The great Athenian leader Pericles said that Athenians who did not fully participate in voting, political debate, and holding office were “useless.” The Greek philosopher Aristotle did him one better by declaring such Athenians to be beasts. It seems that many Athenians agreed. Participating in government and making the city-state work was simply what good citizens should do.

In Rome, the idea of a good citizen was a bit different. During the years of the Roman Republic from 509 BCE until roughly 44 BCE Roman citizenship qualifications and rights fluctuated but close to those described in this Mini-Q. Unlike Athenians, a Roman citizen was judged more by his conduct with his family, his neighbors, and his property. A Roman citizen who did not participate in local government would not likely have been called a beast.

It’s important to note that comparing Athens and Rome is in some ways like comparing a flea and an elephant. Athens in 400 BCE had a population of about 300,000, including slaves. Rome, and the empire that it ruled, had an estimated population in 1 CE of about 45,000,000, perhaps 15 percent of the world’s population. Athens, a land-locked city-state, was about the size of Rhode Island. The Roman Republic (see map) was huge.

In Athens and Rome, citizenship was something to be honored and protected. Not everyone could have it, and those who did had a special relationship to the state. The documents that follow should help deepen your understanding of how Athenians and Romans viewed the matter. Imagine life as a citizen of Athens and as a citizen of Rome. Then address the question: Citizenship in Athens and Rome: Which Was the better system?
Background Essay Questions

1. What two Mediterranean societies are being compared? During what approximate time period?

2. The essay says that citizenship often strikes a balance between rights and responsibilities. Give an example of a citizen’s rights and an example of his or her responsibilities.

3. What point was being made by the Athenians Pericles and Aristotle when they used the words “useless” and “beast”?

4. What was the difference in population and area between the city-state of Athens and the Roman Republic?

5. Can you make a logical guess how size might affect a nation’s willingness to grant citizenship?

6. Define these terms:
   - citizen
   - subjects
   - social contract theory of citizenship
   - city-state
   - philosopher
   - Roman Republic

509 BCE— Beginning of Roman Republic
448 – 404 BCE— Golden Age of Athens
429 BCE— Death of Pericles
27 BCE— Julius Caesar becomes dictator of Rome
1 – 100 BC— Further expansion of the Roman Empire
Understanding the Question and Pre-Bucketing

Understanding the Question

1. What is the analytical question asked by this Mini-Q?

2. What terms in the question need to be defined?

3. Rewrite the question in your own words.

Pre-Bucketing

Directions: Using any clues from the Mini-Q question and the document titles on the cover page, create analytical categories and label the buckets.
Document A

Athens and Rome: Who Could Be a Citizen?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Roman Republic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Free adult males</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free adult females</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male children</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female children</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slaves</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freed slaves</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
- Athens: If parents free-born Athenians
- Rome: If parents were married in certain areas of Roman Empire
- Rome: But had limited rights. Could own property, but could not vote or hold public office.
- Athens: Had to complete education and two years of military training before being granted citizenship
- Rome: At birth if parents were citizens
  (Male citizens were eligible for military draft from ages 16 to 60)
- Rome: At birth if parents were citizens
- Rome: Sons of freed slaves were citizens

Note: In Athens, all citizens had the same rights and responsibilities.
In Rome, there were different classes of citizen—some had more rights than others.

Document Analysis

1. What was required for an adult male to become a citizen of Athens? A Roman male?

2. Could women become citizens in Athens and Rome? Could slaves?

3. Were all citizens equal in Athens? In Rome?

4. In your opinion, which system, Athens or Rome, was more generous in granting citizenship to its people? Explain.
Document B

Source: From a speech titled “The Polity of Athenians” by The Old Oligarch, circa 424 BCE. The identity of The Old Oligarch is unknown

I shall say that at Athens [...] it is the poor which mans the fleet and has brought the state her power, and the steersmen and the boatswains and the shipmasters and the lookout-men and the shipwrights—these have brought the state her power much rather than the ... best-born and the elite. This being so, it seems right that all should have a share in offices filled by lot or by election, and that any citizen who wishes should be allowed to speak. For if the poor and the common people and the worse elements are treated well, the growth of these classes will exalt [glorify] the democracy....

Note: A struggle for political and social equality began in Rome in the 5th century BCE. In 451, legal protection (though not equality) was granted to all Romans enjoying some level of citizenship. By 287 BCE, the struggle was over, and all Roman citizens were equal under the law and could strive for political office.

Source: From varied sources

As Rome extended citizenship to people who lived further and further from the mother city, they adjusted the rights those new citizens received. For example:

1. Latini—people from the Latin states on the Italian peninsula—were granted a class of citizenship with limited rights. Latini enjoyed jus commercii (the right to transact business) and jus migrationis (the right to travel and live within the Empire, but not jus connubii—the right to an official marriage sanctioned by Rome). These limitations were also placed on freed slaves and native-born Romans convicted of crimes.

2. Socii or Foederati—citizens of states with treaty obligations with Rome—were given limited rights in return for performing military service.

3. Peregrini—foreigners in conquered lands, like the Gauls—could be given full or partial citizenship. All of this contrasted with Athens, where once citizenship was granted, citizens enjoyed equal rights.

Document Analysis

1. What is The Old Oligarch’s main idea when he says it is “the steersmen...and the shipwrights” [ship-builders] who have brought the city-state power?

2. What is the significance of the fact that Athenians allowed a poor and common man to win a position in the government “by lot” [lottery]?

3. Do you think this was a wise practice by the Athenians? Explain.
Document B-2

Source: From a speech by Claudius, Emperor of Rome, 48 CE.

Note: In this speech, Emperor Claudius responds to criticism for granting citizenship to conquered residents of Gaul (modern-day France).

What was the ruin of Sparta and Athens, but this, that mighty as they were in war, they spurned them as aliens [foreigners] those whom they had conquered? Our founder, Romulus, on the other hand, was so wise that he fought as enemies and then hailed as fellow-citizens several nations on the very same day.

Document Analysis

1. According to Claudius, speaking nearly 500 years later, what was the ruin of Athens?

2. How might Claudius argue that giving citizenship and high office to conquered Gauls would be good for Rome?

3. Do you think this was a wise practice by the Romans? Explain
Document C

Source: Diodorus Siculus, History, Book XI. Written between 60 and 30 BCE.

And the law is as follows: Each citizen wrote the name of the man who in his opinion had the greatest power to destroy the democracy; and the man who got the largest number of ostraka was obliged to go into exile from his native land for a period of ten years.

The Athenians, it appears, passed such a law, not for the purpose of punishing wrongdoing, but in order to lower through exile the [position] of men who had risen too high. Now Themistocles, having been ostracized in the manner we have described, fled as an exile from his native city to Argos....

Note: Only one ostracism was permitted in Athens per year.


In conducting the census of the Roman population, the censors (they were elected in pairs) not only counted Rome’s citizens but … ranked them into distinct classes.... The censors’ ranking, based on wealth, heritage [family standing], administrative competence, marital status, and physical and moral fitness, determined the citizen’s political privileges, his level of taxation, and his military service. Anyone who didn’t meet the standards of the censors could be demoted in rank. If the offender was a senator, this meant expulsion from the Senate.

Note: The Roman census was conducted every five years.

Document Analysis

1. What did it mean when Athenians ostracized a fellow citizen? What was the purpose?

2. Do you think ostracism was a good idea? Explain.

3. How did Rome control the privileges and benefits of citizenship?

4. Do you think giving the censors the power to rank and re-rank citizens into different classes was a good idea? Explain.

5. Judging from the two passages in this document, who had the better system of citizenship, the Athenians or the Romans? Explain.
The Athenian Assembly

The Assembly passed laws, set budgets, and had power to declare war.

The Athenian Assembly met 40 times a year on hillside called Pnyx, near the Acropolis. The site had excellent acoustics.

All of Athens’s 40,000 citizens were encouraged to attend, though travel made that difficult. Six thousand were necessary for a quorum on important issues such as ostracism.

Athenians often chose their officials, including the Council of 500 (an executive committee that oversaw the Assembly), by lot from the general citizenry.

Document Analysis

1. What percent of adult male citizens in Athens could vote in the Assembly?
   What percent were eligible to become members of the smaller Council of 500?

2. Judging by the illustration, what generalization can you make about the attendance of Athenians citizens at Assembly meetings?

3. What does it mean that the Council of 500 was chosen “by lot”? Was that a good idea?

4. Assume that the scene in the drawing is accurate. Does it strengthen or weaken an argument that Athens had a better system of citizenship than Rome? Explain.
Document E

Source: A fresco of the Roman Senate painted by Italian artist Cesare Maccari in the 1880s

During many years of the Roman Republic, members of the Roman Senate (about 300 men) served for life. They usually came from the oldest Roman families and inherited their seats.

Though it started as an advisory body to Roman kings, by the third century BCE, the Senate had full governing power in Rome.

The Senate had primary responsibilities for foreign relations, including selecting ambassadors, making treaties, and creating alliances. They were responsible for war policy, and for the control of public lands. The Senate also tried cases of treason and conspiracy.

Document Analysis

1. How many served in the Roman Senate? How many could serve in the Athenian Assembly?

2. How long was the usual term of service in the Roman Senate?

3. Compare the class make-up of the Roman Senate and the Athenian Assembly (Doc D). What does this comparison tell you about the political power of the average citizen in each society?

4. Compare the two images in Documents D and E. In your opinion, what were the strengths and weaknesses of the membership of the Athenian Assembly and the Roman Senate? Explain.
Bucketing – Getting Ready to Write

Bucketing

Look over all the documents and organize them into your final buckets. Write bucket labels under each bucket and place the letters of the documents in the buckets where they belong. It is OK to put a document in more than one bucket. That is called multi-bucketing, but you need a good reason for doing so. Remember, your buckets are going to become your body paragraphs.

Thesis Development and Road Map

On the chicken foot below, write your thesis and your road map. Your thesis is always an opinion and answers the Mini-Q question. The road map is created from your bucket labels and lists the topic areas you will examine in order to prove your thesis.
From Thesis to Essay Writing

Mini-Q Essay Outline Guide

Working Title

Paragraph #1
Grabber

Background

Stating the question with key terms defined

Thesis and road map

Paragraph #2
Baby Thesis for bucket one

Evidence: supporting detail from documents with document citation

Argument: connecting evidence to the thesis

Paragraph #3
Baby Thesis for bucket two

Evidence

Argument

Paragraph #4
Baby Thesis for bucket three

Evidence

Argument

Paragraph #5
Conclusion: Although statement and restatement of main idea